



National Commission on the Future of the Army
2530 Crystal Drive, Zachary Taylor Building, Suite 5000
Arlington, VA 22202

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

Date: 2 September 2015

Locations: Peterson Air Force Base (AFB), Colorado Springs CO, Centennial Airfield, Denver CO, State Joint Force Headquarters (SJFHQ) and Buckley Air Force Base, Aurora CO

Format: Briefs and round table discussions

Attendees for first meeting:

Commissioner GEN (R) Carter Ham
Commissioner GEN (R) James Thurman
Commissioner LTG (R) Jack Stultz
Executive Director MG (R) Ray Carpenter
Mr. Jim Boatner NCFA Staff
Mr. Mark Pizzuto Alternate Designated Federal Officer (ADFO)
Mr. John Thurman NCFA Staff
Mr. Eric Magnell NCFA Staff
Maj Gen H. Michael Edwards, The Adjutant General (TAG), Colorado National Guard
MG Robbie Asher, TAG, Oklahoma National Guard
Maj Gen Daryl Bohac, TAG, Nebraska National Guard
MG Jefferson Burton, TAG Utah National Guard
BG Thomas Bump, Land Component Commander, New Mexico National Guard
COL James Bledsoe, State Army Aviation Officer, Colorado National Guard
COL Bobby Yandell, G-3, Oklahoma National Guard
COL Kevin Kick, Special Projects, Colorado National Guard
COL John Harrison, Chief of Staff, Oklahoma National Guard
MAJ Kerry Davis, G-3 Operations, Colorado National Guard

Documents Submitted to Commission:

(1) Briefing titled "Regional TAG Forum" consisting of 28 charts presented by Colorado, Nebraska, Oklahoma and Utah TAGs

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

(2) Briefing titled National Commission on the Future of the Army Review of Domestic Operations in Colorado

(3) Maj Gen Edwards provided a packet of information papers on the following topics:

- a. Employment of the Army National Guard (ARNG) for Pre-planned Missions Using 10 U.S.C. §12304b
- b. Active Component (AC) to Reserve Component (RC) Accessions
- c. Effectiveness of the UH-72 Light Utility Helicopter (LUH) as a Training Aircraft
- d. Determine Future Demand for Total Army Aviation
- e. Aviation Restructure Initiative (ARI) Impact to Theater Aviation Sustainment Maintenance Groups (TASMG)
- f. Army National Guard (ARNG) Trade Space for Apaches
- g. Suitable Model for Dwell for the Army National Guard (ARNG)
- h. Requirements for Developing a Competency in the Exercise of Mission Command (MC) in Senior Leaders of the ARNG
- i. Annual Training (AT) and Inactive Duty Training (IDT) Requirements in the Army National Guard (ARNG)
- j. Army National Guard (ARNG) Leader Development Requirement for Unified Land Operations (ULO)
- k. Linkage of Unified Land Operations (ULO) Maneuver Capability to Defense Support to Civil Authorities (DSCA)
- l. The National Guard (NG) State Partnership Program (SPP)
- m. Feasibility of an Optimal "Trainees, Transients, Holdees, and Students (TTHS) like" Capability in the Army National Guard (ARNG)

(4) Briefing titled "Review of Domestic Operations in Colorado"

(5) Brig Gen Peter Byrne, Colorado Director of Joint Staff and JTF Centennial Commander, written statement

(6) ARE Headquarters Command Brief (6 charts)

(7) USASMDC/ARSTRAT Command Overview Briefing (15 charts).

At 0630, Commissioners and NCFA staff moved by MILAIR from Peterson AFB to Centennial Airfield Denver CO, arriving at 0730. Colorado National Guard then provided ground transportation to CO State Joint Force Headquarters (SJFHQ) arriving at 0747.

The first meeting convened at 0757 with opening remarks by Commissioner Ham about the NCFA's purpose, mission and legal requirements. ADFO explained the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) and the Government in the Sunshine Act statutory

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

requirements applicability to the day's events. Each TAG presented briefings on individual State's mission and operations.

Maj Gen Edwards, CO TAG, opened the presentation with a "Total Force" statement and called for doing what's best for the Nation when it comes to size and mix of the total Army. He stated NCFA would play an important role in recommending to Congress and the President on what the future holds for the Army, and how the Army looks across the three components.

Discussion then focused on mobilization statistics, key units and several key points; (1) maintaining current force structure allows flexibility for the future Total Force, (2) ARNG readiness is a Total Army mandate, (3) full time manning reductions would harm foundational readiness and ARNG specific capabilities, (4) multi-component solutions are built on capability and culture, and (5) open lines of communication are key. Each of the TAGs then gave a short Power-point presentation of their own state's missions and composition.

Maj Gen Edwards stated the MOB:Dwell sweet spot was preferred at 1:3 for AVN and 1:4 for other units, rather than the current Secretary of Defense policy of 1:5 for RC MOB:Dwell ratio. TAGs stated the two most important factors for Soldiers, Families, and Employers was predictability and utilization. Giving adequate notice of future deployments is imperative. If a Soldier knows 6-12 months out about a deployment, he is better able to manage the issues at home and work. Soldiers want to be used and execute their missions. Large percentages (61-67%) of the various NG formations have never deployed; most Soldiers want to deploy and want the combat experience.

Collectively the TAGs discussed the following:

(1) Positive effects come from Regionally Aligned Forces (RAF) missions for training and relevancy. Unit leaders gain knowledge from working with security forces from other nations and the unit elements gain deployment experience.

(2) Sustainment Readiness Model (SRM) is the preferred model of readiness, rather than ARFORGEN. SRM provides for a unit to come off an available year, and if not deployed, still remain at higher levels of readiness. This led to discussing RC units being at T2 or T1 training level¹ after a Combat Training Center (CTC) rotation, and then while in their available year, they may deploy or not. If not deployed in the available year, then they should not drop off the training timeline or cycle to reset and go to T5 training level.

(3) Trainees, Transients, Holdees, and Students (TTHS) account for ARNG

¹ Army units routinely report readiness for manning, equipping, and training. Training is reported at various levels labeled T1, T2, etc., based on a unit's ability to conduct collective tasks.

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

has some issues. TAGs stated they like the concept of a holding account where untrained and non-deployable Soldiers can be parked, but they don't want to trade force structure for such an account. Allowing ARNG formations to go above their Force Structure Allowance (FSA) will provide the same unit readiness increase by allowing manning above authorization level to allow for Soldiers away at or awaiting schools.

(4) Look back at the "band of excellence" training paradigm. More full time manning is needed to augment the training requirements in the RC. Additionally the definitions for Attrition and Retention rates are not clear. Each State briefed Military Occupational Skill Qualification (MOSQ) at around 95% and attrition rates between 11-18%. NCFA staff noted that at these attrition and MOSQ rates, the data suggests a large portion of attritions is not MOSQ.

(5) Full-Time Manning (FTM) underpins unit readiness. Quantifying the percentage increases in readiness as direct correlation to a given number increase in FTM is difficult, but increased FTM does decrease the amount of post-mobilization training required prior to a unit's deployment.

(6) Different resourcing levels create different unit levels of readiness between AC and RC. The AC is being funded and trained at the T1 to T2 levels for proficiency at battalion and most brigade level critical tasks at the completion of a CTC rotation. The RC is being funded and trained at the platoon and some company level critical tasks.

(7) Loss of the AH-64s would be a big challenge for Brigade Combat Team (BCT) and ARNG in general. There would not be any AH64s available for training, because AC units are not in geographical proximity and have other training priorities.

(8) RC BCTs and Divisions need to look like AC BCTs and Divisions with a Combat Aviation Brigade and Division Artillery (DIVARTY). A National Training Center rotation for a BCT and affiliated units takes over 4,400 Soldiers on the ground. MG Asher stated there are not enough AH-64s in the Army to conduct all training and required aviation needs worldwide.

(9) The AC should provide officers opportunities for staff and command tours in the RC. Too often the Senior Army Advisor and the State Inspector General positions, which are AC officer positions, are an officer's last AC assignment and they retire and do not rotate back into AC formations. Therefore, they cannot take their RC experience back into AC formations or become flag officers who expose other officers to the RC cultures. This cross-pollination of officers between the AC and RC will help eliminate misconceptions in the Army between the components.

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

(10) State Partnership Programs (SPP) are working well for the States and the Army. If given more dollars from the Army, the States would do more partnership exchanges. There are about 8-10 SPP engagements a year conducted by the Colorado NG and SPP engagements are similar in number for the other States.

The meeting adjourned at 0940. Following a short break and move to an adjacent building, a new meeting to discuss domestic military operations began.

NCFA personnel were joined by the following people for this meeting:

Maj Gen Mike Edwards, TAG-CO
MAJ Gen Daryl Bohac, TAG-NE
Brig Gen Pete Byrne, JTF Commander
COL Kevin Kick, Former CO JS J3
LTC Scott Sherman, Current J3
LTC Chris Lowman, Deputy J3
MSG Luna Rodriguez, J3 NCOIC
COL D.A. Sims, 4ID COS
COL Dave Burwell, Region 8 DCO
COL Gaylene Weber, Region 8 Emergency Preparedness Liaison Officer
LTC Shannon Espinoza, Senior Army Advisor National Guard-CO
MAJ Jason Stuchlik, J35

The meeting convened with opening remarks at 0945 by Commissioner Ham about the NCFA's purpose. ADFO explained the Federal Advisory Committee Act and Government in the Sunshine Act statutory, and their applicability to the meeting.

The meeting was hosted by Maj Gen Edwards CO TAG. Brig Gen Byrne led the discussion along with COL Kick. Briefing focused on State experience marshalling operational support for the Waldo Canyon fire in 2012, and then for Black Forest fire and widespread regional flooding in 2013. Colorado has a standing OPLAN, Centennial Sentinel, that includes response plans for fire and floods and requires annual refresher firefighting training in the spring with a communications rehearsal involving civil, Colorado NG and Fort Carson personnel. The Colorado ARNG also generally devotes one drill weekend per year to domestic support operations as well as one planning exercise per year and one full up major exercise every three years. A National Guard Reaction Force (NGRF), a security requirement in every state or territory, was also mentioned although no examples of use were discussed.

Other discussion topics included airspace coordination led by a "civil air boss" for fire operations, Army Reserve role in domestic support, and any commander's inherent authority to provide immediate response to a domestic emergency to save lives regardless of component. A review of immediate response is generally required within 72

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

hours. 4ID commander's intent is to provide immediate assistance to any competent civil authority to prevent loss of life, limb or property for up to a 120-day period. A dual status (both Titles 10 and 32) commander was successfully used for 2012 and 2013 domestic operations to improve speed of initial response and unity of effort – leveraging pre-negotiated support agreements with other states (Emergency Management Assistance Compact or EMAC) and issuing timely verbal instructions (verbal order of the commander) to all units. One limitation cited was that ARNG full time employees (Active Guard and Reserve or AGRs) could not be used for immediate response.

COL Burwell noted that Army Reserve units will generally take about 3-4 days to respond unless a unit happens to be at their armory for training when a domestic emergency happens. In general, Army Reserve forces are most well suited to assist when a true catastrophic or 'major disaster' happens in accordance with 10 U.S.C. §12304a. National Guard provides the bulk of support in most situations. One comment was that a Reserve unit may have a unique capability with respect to domestic support. It was also noted that USAR did not have a representative at the JTF operations center in 2013 while 4ID did. There was general agreement that current 10 U.S.C. §12304a language did not need to be changed for domestic response. Finally, several noted there is a lack of detailed plans for domestic military operations that include and leverage capabilities available in civil organizations, as well as capabilities from all military units in a given geographic area.

The meeting adjourned at 1040 and NCFA personnel departed the SJFHQ at 1045 via ground transport to Buckley AFB, Aurora CO where they met with the US Pacific Command (USPACOM) 168th Army Reserve Intelligence Element (ARE).

At the USPACOM Joint Intelligence and Operations Center, Buckley Air Force Base, the Commissioners and NCFA staff held a round table discussion with the 168th ARE HQ Commander and selected unit personnel.

Attendees in addition to NCFA personnel were:

COL Bischoff, Commander, PACOM JIOC ARE

SGM Stockdale, SGM, PACOM JIOC ARE

MAJ Brown, Executive Officer, PACOM JIOC ARE

CW5 Ramos, Senior All-Source Analyst

LTC Ball, Deputy Commander, PACOM JIOC ARE

LTC Schooner, Chief, PACOM ARE Minneapolis Detachment

SGT Peterson, NCOIC Imagery Analyst

CPT Pelcy, Analyst

SGT Inez, Analyst

Michael Lunstad, PACOM JIOC ARE Administrator

SFC Phelps, Senior HR NCO

MSGT Prebble, Senior Imagery Analyst

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

The meeting convened with opening remarks by Commissioner Ham about the NCFA's purpose, mission and legal requirements. ADFO called the meeting to order at 1130 and explained the Federal Advisory Committee and the Government in the Sunshine Act's statutory requirements.

The discussion focused on the mission and capabilities of the PACOM JIOC ARE and the challenges the unit is facing. The JIOC is a joint unit where US Navy owns and operates the facilities, and all elements enjoy a good working relationship. While acknowledging there are challenges in combining the different Service cultures, there are far more opportunities to learn from the expertise that other Services bring to the intelligence organization. ARE is operational year round because they work real intelligence requirements for PACOM and are not merely training for a wartime mission.

The products produced by the ARE are in high demand by PACOM. ARE has had challenges finding sufficient funding to send personnel to Hawaii for annual training and to support other PACOM requirements. Going forward to Hawaii is preferable for the Soldiers because they get to work on real time projects while at PACOM and build stronger personal relationships with the PACOM personnel. PACOM now requests individual analysts by name for certain projects.

Commissioners asked about training challenges for the ARE. ARE leadership explained that they do face some challenges with respect to training. They are able to complete the mandatory Army Regulation 350-1 training requirements by allocating three hours during each drill period for Soldiers to complete training requirements at the unit. This is also made easier with online training that they can complete at home. The greatest training challenge is finding opportunities to train on individual Army skills such as rifle and pistol marksmanship.

Commissioners asked the Soldiers how they found out about this unique unit and the difficulty of joining the unit. Soldiers explained they have experienced difficulties in transferring out of the Active Component or National Guard into the Army Reserve. It took many months for the personnel paperwork and security requirements to be completed and often there is not a clear path for promotion within the reserve unit. The lack of a clear promotion path makes it difficult to serve an entire career within the unit. However, they have not had recruiting or reenlistment problems as Soldiers tend to remain with the unit as long as possible and they are committed to recruiting their own replacements into the unit.

Commissioners asked the Soldiers how their employers felt about their USAR jobs. The Soldiers explained that, for most of their employers, their USAR role was positive and employers were proud of the employee's service. Many of the Soldiers had civilian careers that directly related to their positions as imagery analysts. The biggest difficulty is

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

not having enough predictability regarding their mobilizations. One Soldier explained that even though a mobilization or rotation might be known about weeks ahead, challenges regarding funding often meant his mobilizations were not confirmed until days before the mobilization was to start, which meant he could not give his employer enough time to prepare for his absence.

The meeting adjourned at approximately 1225.

NCFA personnel that moved by ground transport to the Aviation Support Dining Facility at Buckley AFB for lunch with Colorado Governor John Hickenlooper and Soldiers.

In addition to NCFA personnel, the following personnel attended the lunchtime round table discussion:

Governor John Hickenlooper, Colorado Governor
Maj Gen Mike Edwards, TAG-CO
COL Laura Clellan, COARNG Land Component Commander
COL Adam Silvers, COARNG G-3
COL Mike Willis, 169 FAB CR
LTC Scott Sherman, J-3
COL Kevin Kick, Special Projects, COARNG
LTC Craig Jones, G-4
LTC Josh Day, State Aviation Officer
LTC Isaac Martinez, G-6/193rd MP Battalion Commander
LTC Bren Rogers, J-57
MAJ Brett Martin, XO, Theatre Special Operations Detachment
CW5 Steve Imeraj, State Command Chief Warrant Officer
MAJ Cara McLean, S-1, 89th Troop Command
CW5 Matt Dorram, Former State Command Chief Warrant Officer
CSM Bill Woods, State Senior Enlisted Leader
CSM Jim Bunch, 168th Regional Training Institute
SGM Seth Yount, 89th Transportation Command Operations SGM
MSG Luis Luna Rodriguez, J-3 NCOIC
CSM Greg Clancy, G-1SGM & CSM for 2-135 AV
CSM Ed Macias, 169th FAB CSM
MSG Denise Drummond, G-3 NCO

Governor Hickenlooper and Commissioner Ham made opening comments to the group, followed by lunch with Commissioners dispersed at four large tables, for informal question and answer discussion. Following the lunchtime discussion, NCFA personnel departed the dining facility at 1410 for a forty-minute MILAIR flight back to Peterson AFB CO. They moved by ground transport to US Army Space and Missile Defense Command (SMDC) Headquarters, Building # 3, Fort Carson, CO, arriving at 1500.

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

Commissioners and NCFA staff met with the SMDC Deputy Commander and selected staff for a briefing and open discussion. Attendees in addition to NCFA commissioners and staff were:

BG Gregory Bowen, Deputy CG, SMDC/Army Strategic Command (ARSTRAT)
MG Daniel York, Commander 76th Operational Reserve Command
BG Donald Laucirica, Asst TAG Colorado
COL Kelly Spillane, SMDC/ARSTRAT Deputy Commander for Support
COL Deborah Wilson, SMDC/ARSTRAT Reserve Affairs Officer
COL Michael Rowells, Deputy Commander, 76th ORC
LTC Rolland Quidachay, 100th AMD Brigade (Bde)
LTC Bryan Ross, NGB
LTC Thomas Rivenbark, NGB
MAJ Elizabeth Helland, 1st Space Bde

Commissioner Ham provided opening remarks at 1512, and the ADFO explained FACA and Government in Sunshine Act statutory requirements and applicability. The meeting was hosted by BG Bowen Deputy Commander SMDC, the first National Guard General Officer to serve in this billet.

Briefing started with SMDC/ARSTRAT mission, organization and global locations. The Army is the largest user of Space capabilities in DOD with more than two satellite receivers for every US Soldier in the Middle East. One illustration was a photo of the 31D Main Command Post with numerous visible satellite antennas. SMDC/ARSTRAT executes the Army's Title 10 global command Service responsibilities for Space and Missile Defense. They are currently operating in eleven time zones around the world. There are over 3,500 personnel in this multi-component command (Regular, Guard and Reserve) including military, government civilians, and contractors. The command integrates the three Army components almost seamlessly. SMDC Headquarters also is responsible for institutional missions for space and missile defense capabilities and material development across the Army.

The 1st Space Brigade is the Army's only Space Brigade and organized as a multi-component unit with a Regular Army Signal Battalion, RA and USAR Space Battalion, and ARNG Space Battalion. The brigade is forward stationed at multiple locations in small teams including Joint Tactical Ground Stations (JTGS) in Europe, Asia and the Middle East. JTGS is the Army's primary system that provides space based integrated, in-theater missile warning to Combatant Commanders. Many 1st Space personnel are in the communication, engineering and intelligence specialties and there is limited upward promotion mobility in certain ranks and specialties. They would really like to see some form of specialty ranks established where these highly skilled individuals can continue doing this work instead of being promoted out of their job. The long lead time to retrain

SUBJECT: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) Minutes - Site Visit to Colorado

Soldiers into space-related specialties is also a significant challenge.

The 100th Missile Defense Brigade (RA and ARNG) provides ground-based midcourse defense for US and other designated areas with redundant command and control capabilities in Alaska and Colorado. There have AN/TPY-2 Forward Based Mode radars deployed worldwide (same general locations as above). The 49th Missile Defense Battalion Commander is a dual status commander as Title 32 and Title 10 when on duty at Fort Greely, Alaska. Currently, they use contractors on staff to fill in for Soldiers who are out for training and other reasons and would prefer additional authorized Soldiers. The 49th Battalion also operates under a number of Memorandums of Understanding to allow for domestic operations under both Title 10 and Title 32. They asked if there was a way to simplify this arrangement.

One key problem area discussed is the Active and Reserve Component personnel and training management systems are not yet interoperable – very important the Army continue to push to consolidate and integrate these systems. The lack of interoperability makes it difficult for Soldiers to understand assignment options or even see opportunities in the other Army components as they try to manage their careers. The scheduled fielding of the Integrated Personnel and Pay System Army (IPPS-A) over the next several years could be a big step forward here. Also, UICs (Unit Identification Codes) and FTNs (Force Tracking Numbers) are not consistent across the components and in some cases RC personnel and units are not getting proper credit for operational deployments.

The meeting adjourned at 1625 and NCFA personnel returned to their hotel for the evening.